Minutes of the Meeting of the Technical & Evaluation Committee for evaluation of Request for Proposals (RFP) submitted for Hiring Technical Support Agency for providing Project Management Services under DDUGKY, ASRLMS

NO:ASRLMS/DDU-GKY/4976/Part-I/2023-24/86 Dated:-10-11-2023

MEMBERS PRESENT:

- a) Smt. Krishna Baruah, ACS, State Mission Director, ASRLMS.
- b) Shri Utpal Sarma, AFS, Chief Finance Controller, ASRLMS
- c) Shri Ajit Narzary, State Project Manager-Finance & Accounts, ASRLMS.
- d) Shri Joy Das, State Project Manager(M.C.J.AS), Skills, ASRLMS
- e) Shri Madhurjya Das, Project Manager-Finance & Procurement, ASRLMS.
- f) Shri Jitendra Sarmah, Project Manager-Finance & Procurement, Skills, ASRLMS

The Meeting of the Technical and Evaluation Committee was held on 10th November, 2023 at 11:00 AM in the Office Chamber of State Mission Director, ASRLMS under the Chairmanship of State Mission Director to review and examine the Request for Proposals received for Hiring Technical Support Agency for providing Project Management Services under DDUGKY, ASRLMS. The Request for Proposal was issued on 19th October,2023 vide RFP Reference No-ASRLMS/DDU-GKY/4976/2023-24/399 Dated 19th October 2023 in Government e Marketing (GeM) Portal and the last date of submission of Bid was on 9th November 2023 till 2:00 P.M in GeM Portal.

The Pre-proposal meeting was held on 1st November,2023 at 1:00 PM in the Office of State Mission Director, ASRLMS where representatives of Two prospective Bidders naming Grant Thornton Bharat LLP and Ernst & Young LLP attended the meeting. SMMU-ASRLMS clarified the doubts raised by Bidders in preparation of RFP Proposal for submission in the pre-proposal meeting.

In response, One (1) Bidder naming Grant Thornton LLP have submitted RFP document till last date of submission. The roadmap for technical presentation is Consultant specific & technical experience, adequacy and quality of the proposed methodology, Work Plan, organisation & staffing pattern, Key Expert qualification, expertise & experience.

The Technical and Evaluation Committee evaluated the RFP (Technical Proposal) submitted by the Single Bidder naming Grant Thornton Bharat LLP as per criteria mentioned in the RFP Document. The Request for Proposal (RFP) Evaluation Scoresheet has been prepared after evaluating the Technical proposal submitted 'by Single Bidder on 10th November 2023 at 4:00 PM. As per RFP Evaluation Scoresheet it was found that the Bidder was able to qualify in the Technical Evaluation scoring 82.40 Marks which is more than 75 passing marks in the Technical Evaluation Stage. The RFP Evaluation Scoresheet placed in Annexure 1

Dentu.

The justification for acceptance of Single Proposal submitted by Bidder naming Grant Thornton Bharat LLP is detailed below:-

1. SMMU-ASRLMS have issued Expression of Interest twice for hiring Technical Support Agency for proving project management consultancy services under DDUGKY, ASRLM'. The First Expression of Interest (EoI) was issued on 24th May 2023 by publishing the Paper Ad in Three (3) English Daily "The Assam Tribune", The Times of India (New Delhi Edition), The Hindustan Times (New Delhi Edition) and One Assamese Daily "Ninomiya Barta" and last date of submission of EOI Proposal was on 15th June 2023 but due to technical issues and amendment in scope of services, it was decided to call for fresh EOI Proposal through wide publicity of advertisement. Further, the 2nd Expression of Interest was issued on 14th June 2023 by issuing Paper Advertisement in Two English Newspaper 'The Times of India" and The Assam Tribune" for wide publicity of advertisement and floating the Tender in Assam Tenders e-Procurement Portal i.e www.assamtenders.gov.in.

However, as per instruction from Hon'ble Minister, P&RD Dept to initiate the Tender in Government e-Marketing Portal, it was decided to call for RFP Proposal in Government e Marketing (GeM) portal for the third time on 19th October 2023 and the last date of submission of Bid was on 9th November 2023 till 2:00 P.M in GeM Portal. In response, only one (1) Bidder have submitted RFP Proposal online in Government e Marketing (GeM) portal till last date of submission on 9th November,2023.

In the light of above context, since ASRLMS has initiated EOI Proposal twice as stated above and already Five (5) Months time has taken for initiating the process of Tendering for selection of Hiring Technical Support Agency for providing Project Management Services under DDUGKY, ASRLMS, the proposal for acceptance of Single RFP Proposal may be accepted as the prospective Consultant is technically qualified and has proven thematic experience in providing advisory services for providing project management consultancy services under skill development sector. As per provision laid down in Rule No 23 (20) (ii) of Assam Public Procurement Rules, 2020, the Bid Evaluation Committee shall prepare a justification note, in which the specific views of the Finance and Accounts Officials/Members shall be necessary and on which the approval of the next higher authority of the procuring entity in terms of the relevant Delegation of Financial Powers shall be obtained.

Hence, considering the justification cited above for acceptance of single responsive bid who fulfils the criteria as per provision laid down Rule 23 (20) in APPR 2020, the Committee decided for acceptance of single responsive bid of Grant Thornton Bharat LLP.

Qualio

The Meeting ended with vote of thanks from the chair.

Signature:-

a) Krishna Baruah, ACS, State Mission Director, ASRLMS.

b) Utpal Sarma, AFS, Chief Finance Controller, ASRLMS

c) Ajit Narzary, State Project Manager-Finance & Accounts, ASRLMS

d) Joy Das, State Project Manager(M.C.J.AS), Skills, ASRLMS

e) Madhurjya Das, Project Manager-Finance & Procurement, ASRLMS.

g) Jitendra Sarmah, Project Manager-Finance & Procurement, Skills, ASRLMS

RFP No:- ASRLMS/DDU-GKY/4976/2022-23/399 Dated 19th October, 2023

Request for Proposal (RFP) Evaluation Sheet for Consulting Services:- Hiring Technical Support Agency for providing project services under DDU-GKY, ASRLMS.

			PAI	RT-A		PART-B						
	9	The firm should be in business of consulting services in India for atleast last five years ending on 30.09.2023	The Firm should have an annual average turnover from consultancy of INR 10 Crore or above in the last three financial years i.e. 2019-20,2020-21,2021-22	The firm should have provided services as Project Management Consultancy & Advisory Services of contract duration not	The firm should have experience in facilitating. closure/blacklisting/recovery in atleast 2 skill development project under State/Central Govi during last 5 years	Experience of the Consultant (as a Firm)			Proposed Methodology and Work Plan			
SL No						An annual average turnover from consuliancy business of Rs. 10.00 Crore and above in the last three financial years ic 2019 20,2028-21,2021-22	Project Management Consultancy & Advisory services of contract duration not less than 2 years in skill development sector for atleast 1 project in Central/State Govt in last 5 years—3 marks For each additional Project experience over & above minimum requirement and subject to maximum of Two(2) Project Experience executed in less 15 years—1.5 marks for each additional assignment	Experience in facilitating closure/blacklisting/recovery in attent 2 skill development project under State! Zeentral Govt. during last 5 years—3 marks For each additional project experience over and above minimum requirement and subject to maximum of One(1) Project Experience executed in the last 5 years: 1.00 mark for one additional assignment	Adequacy and quality of the proposed methodology, work plan & organisation & staffing pattern in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs).	Team Leader (TL)	Thematic Experi- Mobilisation,Counselling,Job Fairs & Alumni Support(I)	
								4	40	10	5	
	Maximum Marks							Technical approach & Methodology	General Qualification: 2.00	General Qualification: 1,00		
	Sub Marks Scale>								-20 points Work plan as per Deliverables - 10	Experience & Adequacy for the	Experience & Adequacy for the	
									points	assignment: 6,00	assignment: 3.00 Relevant experience in the region:	
									Organisation and staffing pattern- 10	Relevant experience in the NE region: 2.00	1.00	
									For Technical Approach & Methodology. Not Relevant: 2 (10% of allotted marks). Un-Satisfactory 6: (30% of allotted marks). Satisfactory: 12 (60% of allotted marks). Sectlent 20 (100% of allotted marks). Work Plan Not Relevant: 1 00 (10% of allotted marks). Work Plan Not Relevant: 1 00 (10% of allotted marks). Satisfactory: 3 00 (30% of allotted marks). Satisfactory: 6 00 (60% of allotted marks). Excellent: 10 (100 % of allotted marks). Excellent: 10 (100 % of allotted marks). Onc. 4 not allotted marks). Un-Satisfactory: 3 00 (30% of allotted marks). Satisfactory: 6 00 (60% of allotted marks). Satisfactory: 6 00 (60% of allotted marks). Good. 8 00 (80% of allotted marks). Excellent: 10 (100 % of allotted marks). Excellent: 10 (100 % of allotted marks). Excellent: 10 (100% of allotted marks).	General Qualification:Poor: 0.60 (30% of allotted marks), Setisfactory: 1.2 (60% of allotted marks), Good 1.60 (80% of follotted marks), Excellent 2.00 (100% of allotted marks). Experience and Adequaey for the assignment Poor 1.80 (30% of allotted marks), Stafsactory: 3.60 (60% of allotted marks), Good: 4.80 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent 6.00 (100 % of allotted marks). Relevant Experience in Region: Poor: 0.60 (30% of allotted marks), Setisfactory: 1.20 (60% of allotted marks), Good: 1.60 (80% of allotted marks), Geod: 1.60	(60% of allotted marks), Good: 0.80 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.0 (100 % of allotted marks) Experience and Adequsey for the assignment Poor 0.9 (30% of allotted marks), Satisfactory : 1.80 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent 3.00 (100 % of allotted marks). Excellent Experience in Region: Poor: 0.30 (30% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.60 (60% of allotted marks), Good: 0.80	
1	Grant Thornton Bharat LLP, Address: 2 Ist Boor, DLF Square, Jacaranda Marg, DLF Phagare, Gurgaon-122002 Ph. No. 1244628000 Email: Padmanand V@m gt.com, kunal sood@in gt.com	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	The Firm is having Annual Average Turnover of 373.65 Crore during last Three (3) FYs as per Audit Reports submitted	The Firm is having experience in 4 relevant assignments	The Firm is having experience in 4 relevant projects found	For Technical Approach & Methodology Good-16, Work Plan-Good-8; Organisation and staffing pattern:-Good- 8	Name:Prasan Dutta For General Qualification Good-1 6; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment::Good-4 8 Relevant Experience in Region-Good- 1.6	Name Kunal Sutradhar For General Qualification Good-0 8; Expenence and Adequacy for the assignment 'Good-2 4 Relevant Experience in Region-Good- 0 8	
						2.00	6.00	4.00	32.00	8.00	4.00	

Quends. 600

Manal 40

PART-B

Experts Qualifications and competence for the Assignment,

of allotted marks), Satisfactory 0.60 (60% of allotted marks), Good. 0.80 (60% of allotted marks), Good. 0.80 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.00 (100 % of allotted marks). Excellent: 1.00 (10									<u> </u>	
General Qualification: 1.00 General Qualific		Coordination, Inspection & SoP			Thematic Expert-Legal Services(1)	Management Executive (1)	Management Executive (2)	MIS Analyst(1)	MIS Analysi(2)	Total Marks
General Qualification: 1.00 General Qualific										
Experience & Adopuscy for the statements 3.00				5		2	2	2	2	100
subjanced 1.06 Selected a capterines the regions 1.08 Selected a capterine the regions 1.00 Selected a capterine the region 1.00 Selected a capt										
General Qualification Pror. 0.30 (10%) of alloted marks). Statisfactory 0.00 (10%) of alloted marks). Statisfa	nssignment: 3.00	assignment: 3,00	assignment: 3.00	assignment: 3,00	assignment: 3,00					
General Qualifications Pover 0.30 (10% of allosted marks). Sestification 9.00 (10% of allosted marks). Sestifi						Relevant experience in the region: 0,4				
For General Qualification:Good-0.8; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment:Good-2.4 Relevant Experience in Region-Good-0.8 Relevant	of alloited marks), Satisfactory .0 60 (80% of alloited marks), Good 0.80 (80% of alloited marks), Excellent: 1 00 (100 % of alloited marks) Excellent: 1 00 (100 % of alloited marks), Excellent: 1 00 9. (30% of alloited marks), Satisfactory 1 80 (60% of alloited marks), Good: 2.40 (80% of alloited marks), Excellent: 3 00 (100 % of alloited marks), Relevant Experience in Region: Poor 1 30 (30% of alloited marks), Satisfactory .0 60 (60% of alloited marks), Satisfactory .0 60 (80% of alloited marks), Scoots: Recellent: 1 00	or allotted marks), Salisfactory 2.0 60 (80% of allotted marks), Good 0.80 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.00 (100 % of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.00 (100 % of allotted marks), Salisfactory 0.1 80 (60% of allotted marks), Salisfactory 1.1 80 (60% of allotted marks), Sacellent. 3.00 (100 % of allotted marks), Excellent. Sperimen in Region - Poor 1.0 1.0 (30% of allotted marks), Salisfactory 0.60 (60% of allotted marks), Good 0.80 (60% of allotted marks), Good 0.80 (60% of allotted marks), Gellent: 1.00 (60% of a	of allotted marks), Satisfactory . 0.60 (60% of allotted marks). Good . 0.80 (80% of allotted marks). Excellent: 1.00 (100 % of allotted marks). Excellent: 1.00 (100 % of allotted marks). Satisfactory . 1.80 (60% of allotted marks). Satisfactory . 1.80 (60% of allotted marks). Excellent: 3.00 (100 % of allotted marks). Excellent Experience in Region: Poor: 30 (30% of allotted marks). Satisfactory 0.60 (60% of allotted marks). Satisfactory 0.60 (60% of allotted marks). Excellent: 1.00 (80% of allotted marks). Excellent: 1.00 (80% of allotted marks). Excellent: 1.00	of allotted marks), Satisfactory, 0.60 (60% of allotted marks), Good; 0.80 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent; 1.00 (100% of allotted marks) Excellent; 1.00 (100% of allotted marks), Satisfactory; 1.80 (60% of allotted marks), Satisfactory; 1.80 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent; 3.00 (100 % of allotted marks), Excellent; 5.00 (100 % of allotted marks), Codo: 0.80 (60% of allotted marks), Satisfactory; 0.60 (60% of allotted marks), Satisfactory; 0.60 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent; 1.00 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent; 1.00	of allotted marks), Satisfactory, 9.60 (60% of allotted marks), Good: 0.80 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.00 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.00 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 3.00 (100% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 1.180 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent: 3.00 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 5.00 (100% of allotted marks), Experience in Region: Poor: 0.9 (30% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.60 (60% of allotted marks), Good: 0.80 (80% of allotted marks), Good: 0.80	of allotted marks), Salisfactory, 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Cood: 0.32 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent. 0.4 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent. 0.4 (100% of allotted marks), Experience and Adequeey for the assignment: Poor: 0.36 (30% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.72 (60% of allotted marks), Cood. 0.96 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.2 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.2 (100% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4 (1	of allotted marks), Satisfactory . 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Good: 0.32 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4 (100% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.72 (60% of allotted marks), Good: 0.96 (80% of allotted marks), Recellent: 1.2 (100% of allotted marks), Revenuel Experience in Region-Poor: 0.12 (30% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Sati	of allotted marks), Satisfactory : 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Cood: 0.32 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4 (100% of allotted marks) Experience and Adequacy for the assignment: Poor: 0.36 (30% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.72 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.2 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 1.2 (100% of allotted marks), Reveal (20% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4 (10	of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0 24 (60% of allotted marks), Good 0.32 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent 0.4 (100% of allotted marks) Excellent 1.04 (100% of allotted marks) Experience and Adequacy for the assignment: Poor: 0.36 (30% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.72 (60% of allotted marks), Rocellent: 1.2 (100% of allotted marks), Revealtent: 1.2 (100% of allotted marks), Revealtent: 1.2 (100% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Satisfactory: 0.24 (60% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.32 (80% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4 (100% of allotted marks), Excellent: 0.4	
4.00 4.00 4.00 4.00 4.00 1.60 1.60 1.60 1.60 82.40	Name: Uddipta Dutta For General Qualification:Good-0.8; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment:Good-2.4 Relevant Experience in Region-Good- 0.8	For General Qualification:Good-0.8; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment::Good-2.4	For General Qualification:Good-0.8; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment::Good-2.4 Relevant Experience in Region-Good-	For General Qualification Good-0.8, Experience and Adequacy for the assignment::Good-2.4	For General Qualification:Good-0.8; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment:Good-2.4 Relevant Experience in Region-Good-	For General Qualification:Good-0,32; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment:Good-0.96 Relevant Experience in Region-Good-	For General Qualification:Good-0.32; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment::Good-0.96 Relevant Experience in Region-Good-	For General Qualification:Good-0.32; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment:Good-0.96 Relevant Experience in Region-Good-	For General Qualification:Good-0.32; Experience and Adequacy for the assignment:Good-0.96 Relevant Experience in Region-Good-	
	4,00	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	1.60	1.60	1.60	1.60	82.40

Joseph .

Carried Sol Dar

_Am

bol

State Mission Director Assam State Rural Livelihoods Mission Society